

Differences in positions along a hierarchy:
Counterfactuals based on an assignment model

Laurent Gobillon* Dominique Meurs[†] Sébastien Roux[‡]

April 10, 2020

Online Appendix

*Paris School of Economics-CNRS, INED, CEPR and IZA. Address: Paris School of Economics (PSE), 48 Boulevard Jourdan, 75014 Paris, France. Email: laurent.gobillon@psemail.eu.

[†]University of Paris Ouest Nanterre (EconomiX) and INED. Address: Institut National d'Etudes Démographiques (INED), 133 Boulevard Davout, 75980 Paris Cedex 20, France. Email: dominique.meurs@ined.fr.

[‡]INSEE, CREST and INED. Centre de Recherche en Economie et Statistique (CREST), 15 Boulevard Gabriel Péri, 92245 Malakoff Cedex, France. Email: sebastien.roux@ensae.fr.

In this Online Appendix, we prove that $N(u^{\lfloor vN \rfloor} | X) / N \xrightarrow{a.s.} n(v | X)$ for all $v \in (0, 1)$ where gender j enters the set of observable characteristics to simplify the notations. The proof of consistency can be decomposed into three stages:

- We first consider a setting where $\beta(\cdot)$ is constant and we establish consistency using statistical results proposed by Rosén (1972).
- We then extend the consistency result to the case where $\beta(\cdot)$ is piece-wise constant. This is done by proving consistency on each interval.
- We finally extend the consistency result to the case where $\beta(\cdot)$ is a continuous function by using a piece-wise constant approximation of it.

1/ Case of a constant function $\beta(\cdot)$

Lemma B1 (Rosén, 1972). Consider the sampling without replacement of N individuals with weights p_i for $i = 1, \dots, N$, such that $\sum_{i=1}^N p_i = 1$. Define implicitly the function $t(\cdot)$ with the equation:

$$N - y = \sum_{i=1}^N \exp(-p_i t(y)) \quad (29)$$

Attribute to each individual i a quantity a_i and define $Z_k = \sum_{i=1}^N W_i a_i$ where W_i is a dummy for individual i to be in the sample constituted by the first k draws. We then have:

$$EZ_k = \sum_{i=1}^N a_i (1 - \exp[-p_i t(k)]) - r_E (N - k) N^{\frac{1}{2}} \quad (30)$$

$$VZ_k = \sum_{i=1}^N \left[a_i - \frac{\sum_{i=1}^N p_i a_i \exp[-p_i t(k)]}{\sum_{i=1}^N p_i \exp[-p_i t(k)]} \right]^2 [1 - \exp[-p_i t(k)]] \exp[-p_i t(k)] + r_V(k) \quad (31)$$

where $\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \max_{\tau_1 \leq k/N \leq \tau_2} |r_E(k)| = 0$ and $\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \max_{\tau_1 \leq k/N \leq \tau_2} |r_V(k)/N| = 0$ for all $0 < \tau_1 < \tau_2 < 1$.

Denote $k = \lfloor uN \rfloor$ with $\lfloor \cdot \rfloor$ denoting the integer part for $u \in (0, 1)$ where we omit the dependance of k with respect to u and N for readability in the proofs, and by u^k the k^{th} empirical rank which is given by $u^k = k/N$. We are going to show that:

$$\frac{N(u^k | X)}{N} = n(u | X) + O(N^{-1/2}) \quad (32)$$

The roadmap of the proof is the following:

1. Using Lemma B1, we will first show that:

$$E [N (u^k | X)] = N (X) \exp [-p_X^N t_N (1 - k/N)] + r_E (k) N^{\frac{1}{2}} \quad (33)$$

with $\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \max_{\tau_1 N \leq k \leq \tau_2 N} |r_E (k)| = 0$ for every $0 < \tau_1 < \tau_2 < 1$, $N (X)$ the number of individuals with characteristics X in the population and $t_N (u) = t (Nu) / N$ with $t (\bullet)$ defined according to (29) with $p_i = p_{X_i}^N$ where:

$$p_X^N = \frac{\exp (X\beta)}{E_{X,emp} [\exp (X\beta)]} \quad (34)$$

with $E_{X,emp}$ the empirical expectation computed using the empirical distribution of X such that:

$$E_{X,emp} [\exp (X\beta)] = \sum_{\ell} N (X^{\ell}) \exp (X^{\ell} \beta) / N \quad (35)$$

2. We will establish the intermediary result that $t_N (u)$ converges almost surely to $t_{\infty} (u)$ over $[0, 1)$, where t_{∞} is implicitly defined by the equation:

$$1 - u = E_X [\exp (-p_X t_{\infty} (u))] \quad (36)$$

where E_X is the expectation computed using the asymptotic distribution of X and:

$$p_X = \frac{\exp (X\beta)}{E_X [\exp (X\beta)]} \quad (37)$$

and show that we have:

$$N^{1/2} (t_N (u) - t_{\infty} (u)) \xrightarrow{L} N \left(0, \frac{1}{(1-u)^2} \vec{g}' (u)' V \vec{g}' (u) \right) \quad (38)$$

where V is a matrix which terms (l, l') for $l \neq l'$ are given by $-n (X^l) n (X^{l'})$ and for $l = l'$ are given by $n (X^l) [1 - n (X^l)]$, and $\vec{g}' (u) = [g (X^1, u), \dots, g (X^L, u)]'$ with $g (X, u) = p_X t_{\infty} (u) E_X [p_X \exp (-p_X t_{\infty} (u))] + \exp [-p_X t_{\infty} (u)]$.

3. From 1/ and 2/, we will deduce that:

$$\frac{E [N (u^k | X)]}{N} = n (u | X) + o (N^{-1/2}) \quad (39)$$

4. Finally, we will get that:

$$\frac{N (u^k | X)}{N} = n (u | X) + O (N^{-1/2}) \quad (40)$$

Step 1 can be shown by applying Lemma B1 with $p_i = p_X^N$ being the probability that an individual has characteristics X , $a_i = 1_{i \in X}$ being a dummy for individual i having characteristics X and the sum (30) being computed for $N - k$ draws. We then have $Z_{N-k} = \sum_{i=1}^N (1 - 1_{i \in \Omega(u^k)}) 1_{i \in X}$ where $1_{i \in \Omega(u^k)}$ denotes the dummy for still being in the risk set after $N - k$ draws such that:

$$EZ_{N-k} = N(X) [1 - \exp[-p_X^N t(N-k)/N]] - r_E(k) N^{\frac{1}{2}} \quad (41)$$

As we have:

$$Z_{N-k} = \sum_{i=1}^N (1_{i \in X} - 1_{i \in \Omega(u^k|X)}) = N(X) - N(u^k|X) \quad (42)$$

equation (41) can be rewritten as:

$$N(X) - E[N(u^k|X)] = N(X) [1 - \exp[-p_X^N t_N(1 - k/N)]] - r_E(k) N^{\frac{1}{2}} \quad (43)$$

with $t_N(u) = t(Nu)/N$. Rearranging the terms, we get expression (33).

Step 2 can be completed by first showing that $t_N(u)$ converges almost surely to $t_\infty(u)$ over $[0, 1]$. Rewriting (29) applied to $p_i = p_{X_i}^N$ where X_i are the characteristics of individual i and $y = Nu$, we get:

$$N - Nu = \sum_{i=1}^N \exp(-p_{X_i}^N t(Nu)) \quad (44)$$

Considering the definition of t_N and the fact that the characteristics of individuals are distributed across the values X^ℓ with $\ell = 1, \dots, N$, we get:

$$1 - u = E_{X,emp} [\exp[-p_X^N t_N(u)]] \quad (45)$$

We have $N(X^\ell)/N \rightarrow n(X^\ell)$ almost surely and thus:

$$\lim_N p_X^N = \frac{\exp(X\beta)}{\sum_\ell n(X^\ell) \exp(X^\ell\beta)} = \frac{\exp(X\beta)}{E_X[\exp(X\beta)]} \equiv p_X \quad (46)$$

Since function $f(x) = E_X[\exp(-p_X x)]$ is continuous and monotonic, we finally have $\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} t_N(u) = t_\infty(u)$ for all $u \in [0, 1]$ with:

$$1 - u = E_X[\exp(-p_X t_\infty(u))] \quad (47)$$

We now establish the asymptotic distribution of t_N . For that purpose, we establish the asymptotic distribution

of $E_X [\exp (-p_X t_N (u))]$ and apply the delta method to the inverse of the function $f(\bullet)$. We have the decomposition:

$$\begin{aligned} E_X [\exp (-p_X t_N (u))] - E_X [\exp (-p_X t_\infty (u))] &= E_X [\exp (-p_X t_N (u))] - E_X [\exp (-p_X^N t_N (u))] \\ &\quad + E_X [\exp (-p_X^N t_N (u))] - E_X [\exp (-p_X t_\infty (u))] \end{aligned} \quad (48)$$

Rearranging the first right-hand side term in (48), we get:

$$E_X [\exp (-p_X t_N (u))] - E_X [\exp (-p_X^N t_N (u))] = E_X [\exp (-p_X t_N (u)) [1 - \exp (- (p_X^N - p_X) t_N (u))]] \quad (49)$$

To develop further this expression, we first derive useful properties for $p_X^N - p_X$. Using the fact that p_X^N converges to p_X , we have:

$$p_X^N - p_X = \frac{\exp (X\beta)}{E_{X,emp} [\exp (X\beta)]} - \frac{\exp (X\beta)}{E_X [\exp (X\beta)]} \quad (50)$$

$$= -\frac{\exp (X\beta)}{E_{X,emp} [\exp (X\beta)] E_X [\exp (X\beta)]} [E_{X,emp} [\exp (X\beta)] - E_X [\exp (X\beta)]] \quad (51)$$

$$= -\frac{\exp (X\beta)}{E_{X,emp} [\exp (X\beta)] E_X [\exp (X\beta)]} \sum_{\ell} [N (X^\ell) / N - n (X^\ell)] \exp (X^\ell \beta) \quad (52)$$

$$= -p_X^N \sum_{\ell} [N (X^\ell) / N - n (X^\ell)] p_{X^\ell} \quad (53)$$

Using the fact that $p_X^N = (p_X^N - p_X) + p_X$ on the right-hand side and rearranging terms by passing those involving $p_X^N - p_X$ on the left-hand side, we get:

$$p_X^N - p_X = -p_X \frac{\sum_{\ell} [N (X^\ell) / N - n (X^\ell)] p_{X^\ell}}{1 + \sum_{\ell} [N (X^\ell) / N - n (X^\ell)] p_{X^\ell}} \quad (54)$$

Using the central limit theorem, we have $N (X^\ell) / N - n (X^\ell) = O (N^{-1/2})$. Using a Taylor expansion of the right-hand side denominator of (54), we then get that:

$$p_X^N - p_X = -p_X \sum_{\ell} [N (X_\ell) / N - n (X_\ell)] p_{X^\ell} + O (N^{-1}) \quad (55)$$

Injecting (55) into (49) and making a Taylor expansion, we get:

$$\begin{aligned} & E_X [\exp(-p_X t_N(u))] - E_X [\exp(-p_X^N t_N(u))] \\ = & -E_X \left[\exp(-p_X t_N(u)) \left[p_X \sum_{\ell} [N(X^\ell)/N - n(X^\ell)] p_{X^\ell} t_N(u) + O(N^{-1}) \right] \right] \end{aligned} \quad (56)$$

$$= - \left[\sum_{\ell} [N(X^\ell)/N - n(X^\ell)] p_{X^\ell} \right] E_X [p_X t_N(u) \exp(-p_X t_N(u))] + O(N^{-1}) \quad (57)$$

Using the fact that $t_N(u) \rightarrow t_\infty(u)$ almost surely, equation (57) becomes:

$$\begin{aligned} & E_X [\exp(-p_X t_N(u))] - E_X [\exp(-p_X^N t_N(u))] \\ = & - \left[\sum_{\ell} [N(X^\ell)/N - n(X^\ell)] p_{X^\ell} \right] t_\infty(u) E_X [p_X \exp(-p_X t_\infty(u))] + o(N^{-1/2}) \end{aligned} \quad (58)$$

The second right-hand side term in (48) can be rewritten considering that by definition:

$$E_X [\exp(-p_X t_\infty(u))] = 1 - u = \sum_{\ell} N(X^\ell) \exp[-p_{X^\ell}^N t_N(u)] / N \quad (59)$$

This yields:

$$\begin{aligned} & E_X [\exp(-p_X^N t_N(u))] - E_X [\exp(-p_X t_\infty(u))] \\ = & - \sum_{\ell} [N(X^\ell)/N - n(X^\ell)] \exp[-p_{X^\ell}^N t_N(u)] \end{aligned} \quad (60)$$

$$= - \sum_{\ell} [N(X^\ell)/N - n(X^\ell)] \exp[-p_{X^\ell} t_\infty(u)] + o(N^{-1/2}) \quad (61)$$

Substituting (58) and (61) into (48) gives:

$$\begin{aligned} & E_X [\exp(-p_X t_N(u)) - \exp(-p_X t_\infty(u))] \\ = & - \sum_{\ell} [N(X^\ell)/N - n(X^\ell)] g(X^\ell, u) + o(N^{-1/2}) \end{aligned} \quad (62)$$

where $g(X, u) = p_X t_\infty(u) E_X [p_X \exp(-p_X t_\infty(u))] + \exp[-p_X t_\infty(u)]$.

The vector $[N(X^1)/N, \dots, N(X^L)/N]'$ contains the averages of dummies for the categories of a multinomial law giving to an individual i a value of explanatory variables X_i . Its expectation is $[n(X^1), \dots, n(X^L)]'$ and its law is asymptotically normal with an asymptotic covariance matrix V which terms (l, l') for $l \neq l'$ are given by $-n(X^l)n(X^{l'})$ and for $l = l'$ are given by $n(X^l)[1 - n(X^l)]$. Defining $\vec{g}(u) = [g(X^1, u), \dots, g(X^L, u)]'$ and

applying the delta method, we obtain:

$$N^{1/2} (E_X [\exp(-p_X t_N(u))] - E_X [\exp(-p_X t_\infty(u))]) \xrightarrow{L} N(0, \vec{g}'(u)' V \vec{g}'(u)) \quad (63)$$

Applying the delta method again to the inverse of function $f(x) = E_X [\exp(-p_X x)]$ which derivative is given by $f^{-1'}(y) = 1/f'(f^{-1}(y)) = 1/E_X [\exp(-p_X f^{-1}(y))]$, and considering the equality (47), we finally get the expression:

$$N^{1/2} (t_N(u) - t_\infty(u)) \xrightarrow{L} N\left(0, \frac{1}{(1-u)^2} \vec{g}'(u)' V \vec{g}'(u)\right) \quad (64)$$

Step 3 can be shown from (33) using Taylor expansions. Indeed, we have by definition that $|u - k/N| \leq 1/N$. We also have from (55) that $p_X^N - p_X = O(N^{-1/2})$ since $N(X)/N - n(X) = O(N^{-1/2})$, and from (64) that $t_N(1-u) = t_\infty(1-u) + O(N^{-1/2})$. This yields that:

$$\exp[-p_X^N t_N(1 - k/N)] = \exp[-p_X t_\infty(1 - u)] + O(N^{-1/2}) \quad (65)$$

and thus, we get from (33):

$$E[N(u^k | X)] / N = n(X) \exp[-p_X t_\infty(1 - u)] + O(N^{-1/2}) \quad (66)$$

Denoting $\bar{n}_X(u) = n(X) \exp(-p_X t_\infty(1 - u))$, it is possible to establish that $\bar{n}_X(u) = n(u | X)$ which will complete the proof. This can be done by deriving $\bar{n}_X(u)$, as we have:

$$\bar{n}'_X(u) = p_X t'_\infty(1 - u) n(X) \exp(-p_X t_\infty(1 - u)) \quad (67)$$

and deriving equation (36), we get:

$$t'_\infty(1 - u) E_X [p_X \exp(-p_X t_\infty(1 - u))] = 1 \quad (68)$$

which yields after substituting $p_X t'_\infty(1 - u)$ by its expression into (67) that:

$$\bar{n}'_X(u) = \frac{p_X n(X) \exp(-p_X t_\infty(1 - u))}{E_X [p_X \exp(-p_X t_\infty(1 - u))]} \quad (69)$$

$$= \frac{p_X \bar{n}_X(u)}{\sum_\ell p_{X^\ell} \bar{n}_{X^\ell}(u)} \quad (70)$$

and, as shown in Appendix A, this expression has a unique solution under the initial condition $\bar{n}(1, X) = n(X)$ which is $n(u | X)$.

Step 4 can be established showing that the variance of $N(u^k | X) / N$ tends to zero as N tends to infinity. Applying Lemma A1 with a_i a dummy for individual i having characteristics X , we get:

$$\begin{aligned} V [N(u^k | X) / N] &= \sum_{\ell} N(X^{\ell}) \left[1_{\{X^{\ell}=X\}} - \frac{N(X) p_X^N \exp[-p_X^N t(N-k)/N] / N}{E_{emp} [p_X^N \exp[-p_X^N t(N-k)/N]]} \right]^2 \\ &\times [1 - \exp[-p_X^N t(N-k)/N]] \exp[-p_X^N t(N-k)/N] / N^2 \\ &+ r_V (N-k) / N^2 \end{aligned} \quad (71)$$

The term in brackets is bounded by one. As function $t(\cdot)$ is positive, $\exp[-p_X^N t(N-k)/N]$ is also bounded by one. This yields:

$$V [N(u^k | X) / N] = O(1/N) + r_V (N-k) / N^2 \quad (72)$$

and this is enough to get: $V [N(u^k | X) / N] \rightarrow 0$ as N tends to infinity.

2/ Case of a piece-wise constant function $\beta(\cdot)$

We now consider the case where the coefficients of explanatory variables are piece-wise constant and we denote them as $\beta(u)$. These coefficients change value at knots v^z such that $\varepsilon < v^1 < \dots < v^Z = 1$ with ε positive and small. We consider the asymptotic case where N , Z and N/Z (the average number of individuals by interval) all tend to infinity. We can apply the proof of case 1/ over the interval $(v^{Z-1}, 1]$ and we have:

$$p \lim E [N(u^k | X) / N] = n(u | X), \forall u \in (v_Z, 1] \quad (73)$$

where:

$$n'(u | X) = \frac{\exp[X\beta(1)] n(u | X)}{\sum_{\ell} \exp[X^{\ell}\beta(1)] n(u | X^{\ell})} \quad (74)$$

with $n(1 | X) = n(X)$. This proves that the limit is $n(u | X)$ as defined in the text on the interval $(v^Z, 1]$. We are going to show recursively that this result holds at lower ranks. Assume that it is true down to rank v^z and consider that $n(v^z | X) = \liminf_{v^z < u} n(u | X)$. Proof of case 1/ can be applied over the interval $(v^{z-1}, v^z]$ and we have:

$$p \lim E [N(u^k | X) / N] = n(u | X), \forall u \in (v^{z-1}, v^z] \quad (75)$$

where:

$$n'(u | X) = \frac{\exp[X\beta(v^z)] n(u | X)}{\sum_{\ell} \exp[X^{\ell}\beta(v^z)] n(u | X^{\ell})} \quad (76)$$

This proves that the limit is $n(u | X)$ as defined in the text on the interval $(v^{z-1}, v^z]$. After iterations, we get the result for the whole interval $[\varepsilon, 1]$.

3/ Case of a continuous function $\beta(\cdot)$

We now consider the case where the coefficients $\beta(u)$ are continuous and we use a step-wise approximation of $\beta(u)$ given by:

$$\beta_Z(u) = \sum_{z=1}^Z \beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right) 1_{\{z/Z - 1 < u \leq z/Z\}} \quad (77)$$

We define by $n_Z(u|X)$ the measure of individuals with characteristics X still available for the job of rank u when the assignment mechanism is defined by $\beta_Z(u)$ instead of $\beta(u)$, and by $N_Z(u|X)$ the random variable that corresponds to the number of individuals with characteristics X still available at rank u under this assignment rule. The proportion of individuals in the population with characteristics X still available at rank u under this assignment rule is given by $P_Z(u|X) = N_Z(u|X)/N$. We have shown in case 2/ that $P_Z(u|X)$ tends to $n_Z(u|X)$ when N , Z and N/Z tend to infinity. The corresponding proportion when using the assignment rule defined by $\beta(u)$ is $P(u|X) = N(u|X)/N$, and we denote by $\Delta P(u|X) = P(u|X) - P_Z(u|X)$ the difference in the proportion of individuals under the two assignment rules.

We are going to show that for any $z \leq Z$ and rank $v^z = \lfloor N \cdot z/Z \rfloor / N$, we have that:

$$\Delta P(v^z|X) = O\left(\frac{1}{Z^{1/2}}\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{N^{1/2}}\right) \quad (78)$$

uniformly over z in the sense that $O(\cdot)$ involves a bound that does not depend on z . The idea of the proof is to consider that:

$$\Delta P(v^{z-1}|X) = E_{\Omega(v^z)}[\Delta P(v^{z-1}|X)] + \varepsilon_{z,X} \quad (79)$$

where $\varepsilon_{z,X}$ is a random component depending on X and $E_{\Omega(v^z)}$ is the expectation operator conditional on the information available at rank v^z , and then bound the right-hand side terms. Equation (78) will be enough together with case 2/ to get our main result. In more details, the proof can be decomposed into the following steps:

- 1. We first show that the random component verifies:

$$\varepsilon_{z,X} = O\left(Z^{-1/2}\right) + O\left(N^{-1/2}\right) \quad (80)$$

- 2. We will then show that we have:

$$E_{\Omega(v^z)}[\Delta P(v^{z-1}|X)] = \Delta P(\Delta v^z|X) + O\left(\frac{1}{Z^2}\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) \max_{\ell} [\Delta P(v^z|X^\ell)] \quad (81)$$

We then obtain (78) by recurrence. Consider first the case $z = Z$. The relationship (78) holds trivially since $N_Z(v^Z|X) = N(v^Z|X) = N(X)$ as $v^Z = 1$. Then, supposing that (78) is true for a given z , it is straightforward from (79), (80) and (81) to show that it is also true for $z - 1$.

3. Finally, the relationship (78) is enough to show that $E [N (u^{\lfloor vN \rfloor + 1} | X)] / N \xrightarrow{a.s.} n(v | X)$ when N tends to infinity and Z is chosen such that Z and N/Z tend to infinity (this is for instance the case when $Z = N^{1/2}$). This can be done by applying the results of case 2/ to the piece-wise constant function $\beta_Z(\cdot)$ since there is then an infinity of positions in each of the intervals defined by the nodes.

Step 1 can be completed considering that the processes underlying $P(v^z | X)$ et $P_Z(v^{z-1} | X)$ are independent, as we have:

$$V_{\Omega(v^z)}(\varepsilon_{z,X}) = V_{\Omega(v^z)} [P(v^z | X) - P(v^{z-1} | X)] + V_{\Omega(v^z)} [P_Z(v^z | X) - P_Z(v^{z-1} | X)] \quad (82)$$

where $V_{\Omega(v^z)}$ is the variance operator conditional on the information available at rank v^z . By construction,

$$\begin{aligned} 0 &\leq P(v^z | X) - P(v^{z-1} | X) \\ &\leq \frac{\lfloor N \frac{z}{Z} \rfloor - \lfloor N \frac{z-1}{Z} \rfloor}{N} \end{aligned} \quad (83)$$

$$\leq \frac{1}{Z} + \frac{1}{N} = O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{N}\right) \quad (84)$$

The same inequality holds for $P_Z(v^z | X) - P_Z(v^{z-1} | X)$ and it yields:

$$V_{\Omega(v^z)}(\varepsilon_{z,X}) = O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{N}\right) \quad (85)$$

which leads to equation (80).

Step 2 can be shown considering that we have:

$$E_{\Omega(v^z)} [P(v^z | X) - P(v^{z-1} | X)] = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=\lfloor N \frac{z-1}{Z} \rfloor + 1}^{\lfloor N \frac{z}{Z} \rfloor} E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{P(u^k | X) \exp(X\beta(u^k))}{\sum_{\ell} P(u^k | X^\ell) \exp(X^\ell \beta(u^k))} \right] \quad (86)$$

To ease the notations in the sequel, we denote the length of an interval as:

$$\Delta_z = \left(\left\lfloor N \frac{z}{Z} \right\rfloor - \left\lfloor N \frac{z-1}{Z} \right\rfloor \right) / N \quad (87)$$

where N and Z are not introduced as subscripts to ease the readability. For all values of X and all values of k such that $\lfloor N \frac{z-1}{Z} \rfloor + 1 \leq k \leq \lfloor N \frac{z}{Z} \rfloor$, we have:

$$P(v^{z-1} | X) \leq P(u^k | X) \leq P(v^z | X) \quad (88)$$

A lower bound for $P(v^{z-1}|X)$ is the decrease of the proportion $P(v^z|X)$ when all the jobs with ranks between v^{z-1} and v^z are filled by individuals with characteristics X , and thus we have the following inequalities:

$$P(v^z|X) - \Delta_z \leq P(u^k|X) \leq P(v^z|X) \quad (89)$$

$$\min_{\frac{z-1}{Z} \leq k \leq \frac{z}{Z}} \exp(X\beta(u^k)) \leq \exp(X\beta(u^k)) \leq \max_{\frac{z-1}{Z} \leq k \leq \frac{z}{Z}} \exp(X\beta(u^k)) \quad (90)$$

Using these inequalities, we obtain that:

$$\begin{aligned} & \Delta_z \frac{(P(v^z|X) - \Delta_z) \min_{\frac{z-1}{Z} \leq k \leq \frac{z}{Z}} \exp(X\beta(u^k))}{\sum_{\ell} P(v^z|X^{\ell}) \max_{\frac{z-1}{Z} \leq k \leq \frac{z}{Z}} \exp(X^{\ell}\beta(u^k))} \\ & \leq \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=\lfloor N\frac{z-1}{Z} \rfloor + 1}^{\lfloor N\frac{z}{Z} \rfloor} E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{P(u^k|X) \exp(X\beta(u^k))}{\sum_{\ell} P(u^k|X^{\ell}) \exp(X^{\ell}\beta(u^k))} \right] \leq \end{aligned} \quad (91)$$

$$\Delta_z \frac{P(v^z|X) \max_{\frac{z-1}{Z} \leq k \leq \frac{z}{Z}} \exp(X\beta(u^k))}{\sum_{\ell} [P(v^z|X^{\ell}) - \Delta_z] \min_{\frac{z-1}{Z} \leq k \leq \frac{z}{Z}} \exp(X^{\ell}\beta(u^k))} \quad (92)$$

and from (86), we get:

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{(P(v^z|X) - \Delta_z) \min_{\frac{z-1}{Z} \leq k \leq \frac{z}{Z}} \exp(X\beta(u^k))}{\sum_{\ell} P(v^z|X^{\ell}) \max_{\frac{z-1}{Z} \leq k \leq \frac{z}{Z}} \exp(X^{\ell}\beta(u^k))} \\ & \leq \frac{E_{\Omega(v^z)} [P(v^z|X) - P(v^{z-1}|X)]}{\Delta_z} \leq \end{aligned} \quad (93)$$

$$\frac{P(v^z|X) \max_{\frac{z-1}{Z} \leq k \leq \frac{z}{Z}} \exp(X\beta(u^k))}{\sum_{\ell} [P(v^z|X^{\ell}) - \Delta_z] \min_{\frac{z-1}{Z} \leq k \leq \frac{z}{Z}} \exp(X^{\ell}\beta(u^k))} \quad (94)$$

We can get another inequality using the fact that $\beta_Z(u)$ converges uniformly to $\beta(u)$, as there exists a constant denoted C such that for all X and k such that $\lfloor N\frac{z-1}{Z} \rfloor + 1 \leq k \leq \lfloor N\frac{z}{Z} \rfloor$, we have:

$$\left| \exp X\beta(u^k) - \exp X\beta_Z\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right) \right| < \frac{C}{Z} \quad (95)$$

Using this inequality and the fact that $\beta_Z(\frac{z}{Z}) = \beta(\frac{z}{Z})$, we deduce from (94) that:

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{(P(v^z | X) - \Delta_z) \left[\exp\left(\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) - \frac{C}{Z} \right]}{\sum_{\ell} P(v^z | X^{\ell}) \left[\exp\left(\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \right]} \\ & \leq \frac{E_{\Omega(v^z)} [P(v^z | X) - P(v^{z-1} | X)]}{\Delta_z} \leq \end{aligned} \quad (96)$$

$$\frac{P(v^z | X) \left[\exp\left(\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \right]}{\sum_{\ell} [P(v^z | X^{\ell}) - \Delta_z] \left[\exp\left(\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) - \frac{C}{Z} \right]} \quad (97)$$

An inequality similar to (94) holds when considering the assignment rule given by $\beta^Z(u)$, and we have:

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{[P_Z(v^z | X) - \Delta_z] \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(u^k | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} \\ & \leq \frac{E_{\Omega(v^z)} [P(v^z | X) - P(v^{z-1} | X)]}{\Delta_z} \leq \end{aligned} \quad (98)$$

$$\frac{P_Z(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} [P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) - \Delta_z] \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} \quad (99)$$

Computing the difference between (97) and (99), we get the inequality:

$$\begin{aligned} & E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^z | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] - E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^{z-1} | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] \\ & \geq \frac{(P(v^z | X) - \Delta_z) \left[\exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) - \frac{C}{Z} \right]}{\sum_{\ell} P(v^z | X^{\ell}) \left[\exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \right]} - \frac{P_Z(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} [P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) - \Delta_z] \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} \end{aligned} \quad (100)$$

We are going to make Taylor expansions of the right-hand side terms of (100). For the denominator of the first term, we have:

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{\ell} P(v^z | X^{\ell}) \left[\exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \right] &= \sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \\ & \quad + \sum_{\ell} \Delta P(v^z | X^{\ell}) \left[\exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \right] \end{aligned} \quad (101)$$

Denoting $\Psi_z = \max_{\ell} [\Delta P(v^z | X^{\ell})]$, we get from (101) that:

$$\sum_{\ell} P(v^z | X^{\ell}) \left[\exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \right] = \sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \quad (102)$$

As we also have $\Delta_z = O(Z^{-1})$, the numerator of the first right-hand side term of (100) can be rewritten such that:

$$(P(v^z | X) - \Delta_z) \left[\exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) - \frac{C}{Z} \right] = P(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) \quad (103)$$

Using (102) and (103), and making an additional Taylor expansion, we get that:

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{(P(v^z | X) - \Delta_z) \left[\exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) - \frac{C}{Z} \right]}{\sum_{\ell} P(v^z | X^{\ell}) \left[\exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \right]} \\ &= \frac{P(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} \left[1 + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \right] \end{aligned} \quad (104)$$

$$= \frac{P(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \quad (105)$$

Similarly, we can rewrite the second right-hand side term of (100) as:

$$\frac{P_Z(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} [P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) - \Delta_z] \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} = \frac{P_Z(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} \left[1 + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) \right] \quad (106)$$

$$= \frac{P_Z(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) \quad (107)$$

This yields after an additional Taylor expansion that:

$$\begin{aligned} & E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^z | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] - E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^{z-1} | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] \\ & \geq \frac{\Delta P(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \end{aligned} \quad (108)$$

$$\geq O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \quad (109)$$

In a similar way, we have:

$$\begin{aligned} & E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^z | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] - E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^{z-1} | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] \\ & \leq \frac{P(v^z | X) \left[\exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \right]}{\sum_{\ell} [P(v^z | X^{\ell}) - \Delta_z] \left[\exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) - \frac{C}{Z} \right]} - \frac{[P_Z(v^z | X) - \Delta_z] \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^k | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} \end{aligned} \quad (110)$$

Using the same line of arguments as before, we get:

$$\sum_{\ell} [P(v^z | X^{\ell}) - \Delta_z] \left[\exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) - \frac{C}{Z} \right] = \sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \quad (111)$$

$$P(v^z | X) \left[\exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \right] = P(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) \quad (112)$$

$$[P_Z(v^z | X) - \Delta_z] \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) = P_Z(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) \quad (113)$$

Hence:

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{P(v^z | X) \left[\exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + \frac{C}{Z} \right]}{\sum_{\ell} [P(v^z | X^{\ell}) - \Delta_z] \left[\exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) - \frac{C}{Z} \right]} \\ &= \frac{P(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} \left[1 + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \right] \end{aligned} \quad (114)$$

$$= \frac{P(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \quad (115)$$

Similarly:

$$\frac{[P_Z(v^z | X) - \Delta_z] \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(u^k | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} = \frac{P_Z(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right) + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(u^k | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} \quad (116)$$

$$= \frac{P_Z(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) \quad (117)$$

Finally, we obtain:

$$\begin{aligned} & E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^z | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] - E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^{z-1} | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] \\ &\leq \frac{\Delta P(v^z | X) \exp\left(X\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)}{\sum_{\ell} P_Z(v^z | X^{\ell}) \exp\left(X^{\ell}\beta\left(\frac{z}{Z}\right)\right)} + O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \end{aligned} \quad (118)$$

$$\leq O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \quad (119)$$

From (109) and (119), we get a lower bound and an upper bound for our quantity of interest that are associated to the same convergence speed. As a consequence, we obtain:

$$E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^z | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] - E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^{z-1} | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] = O\left(\frac{1}{Z}\right) + O(\Psi_z) \quad (120)$$

which can be rewritten as:

$$E_{\Omega(v^z)} [\Delta P(v^{z^{-1}} | X)] = E_{\Omega(v^z)} [\Delta P(v^z | X)] + O\left(\frac{\Delta_z}{Z}\right) + O(\Delta_z \Psi_z) \quad (121)$$

Using the fact that $E_{\Omega(v^z)} \left[\frac{\Delta P(v^z | X)}{\Delta_z} \right] = \frac{\Delta P(v^z | X)}{\Delta_z}$ and $\Delta_z = O(Z^{-1})$, we finally obtain expression (81).

Step 3 can then be completed to obtain our main result. First note that, for any $v \in (0, 1]$, we have that $v^{z^N - 1} \leq \lfloor vN \rfloor / (N - 1) \leq v^{z^N}$ for some z^N and this yields:

$$P(v^{z^N - 1} | X) \leq N(u^{\lfloor vN \rfloor} | X) / N \leq P(v^{z^N} | X) \quad (122)$$

It is thus enough to show that both $P(v^{z^N - 1} | X)$ and $P(v^{z^N} | X)$ tend to $n(v | X)$ to prove our result. We have the following decomposition:

$$\begin{aligned} P(v^{z^N} | X) - n(v | X) &= \left[P(v^{z^N} | X) - P_Z(v^{z^N} | X) \right] + \left[P_Z(v^{z^N} | X) - n_Z(v^{z^N} | X) \right] \\ &\quad + \left[n_Z(v^{z^N} | X) - n(v | X) \right] \end{aligned} \quad (123)$$

where z^N is such that $v^{z^N - 1} \leq \lfloor vN \rfloor / (N - 1) \leq v^{z^N}$.

It can be shown that the first right hand-side term converges to zero as N and Z tend to infinity using result (78). We have already shown that the second right-hand side term converges to zero provided that the number of individuals in each interval, which is approximately N/Z tends to infinity. Finally, the third right-hand side term converges to zero between v^{z^N} converges to v and $\beta_Z(u)$ converges to $\beta(u)$ uniformly over the $[0, 1]$ interval. Indeed, $n_Z(v | X)$ and $n(v | X)$ verify the same differential equation at infinity, which is given by (8), and this equation has a unique solution for the initial conditions $n(X)$. This yields that $P(v^{z^N} | X)$ converges to $n(v | X)$. A similar proof can be applied to show that $P(v^{z^N - 1} | X)$ converges to $n(v | X)$, and we finally get that $N(u^{\lfloor vN \rfloor} | X) / N$ converges to $n(v | X)$.